



Iraq: Who's Got the Best Plan?

	Iraq Study Group Withdrawal	White House Surge	O'Hanlon/Joseph Soft Partition	Conetta Multilateralism	Byman Containment	Edwards Withdrawal
Who's Behind It	From Baker-Hamilton report. Candidates Hillary Clinton (D) and Barack Obama (D) have both adopted the plan, with minor variations. Candidate and congressman Ron Paul (R) supported Senator Obama's Iraq War De-escalation Act of 2007, also based on the report.	Most eloquently expressed by Max Boot in his statement to the House Armed Services Committee. Supported by the Bush administration and candidates Rudolph Giuliani (R), John McCain (R), and Mitt Romney (R).	Devised by Michael E. O'Hanlon from Brookings and Edward P. Joseph from Johns Hopkins. Leslie Gelb and presidential candidate Joseph Biden (D) first articulated the basic contours of a similar plan. Also supported by presidential candidate Sam Brownback (R), with the notable exception that for strategic reasons he does not favor a fixed and public timetable for withdrawal.	Proposed by Carl Conetta of the Project on Defense Alternatives - although elements overlap with some presidential strategies, it has not been taken up as a whole by any candidate.	Stand-alone plan from Daniel Byman at the Center for Peace and Security Studies at Georgetown. Byman testified in front of the House Armed Services Subcommittee as part of hearings on a "Third Way" in Iraq.	Unique plan from candidate John Edwards (D). Edwards' strategy draws upon various sources, but combines them in a way that is different enough to constitute a singular approach.
Troop Numbers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Withdrawal of all combat troops from Iraq by spring 2008 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Surge will create political space for settlement and proper clear-hold-build implementation. • Orderly troop reduction comes later 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If surge results are positive (not expected), they should be used to negotiate partition. • No troop reduction for 12-18 months, until soft partition has been completed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quick withdrawal of all US troops • No more than a few thousand troops left by mid-March 2008 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Substantially reduce troop presence in Iraq as soon as safely possible • 20,000 troops should remain in the region to contain civil war and respond to Iranian intervention 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cap troops at 100,000 • Stop surge and draw down 40,000 - 50,000 troops now • Complete withdrawal within 12-18 months--no funding for new troops



	Iraq Study Group Withdrawal	White House Surge	O'Hanlon/Joseph Soft Partition	Conetta Multilateralism	Byman Containment	Edwards Withdrawal
Reconstruction Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revive and accelerate existing economic and reconstruction efforts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Intensify reconstruction • Implement clear-hold-build strategy as soon as more security is established 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide financial support for job creation and housing programs, identity card issuance, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through multilateral framework 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Testimony emphasizes military actions; reconstruction is not specified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not applicable
Diplomacy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Start dialogue with all of Iraq's neighbors, including Syria and Iran • Include the international community via UNSC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Barring serious economic and military threats, it will be impossible to get Syria and Iran on board. They are fighting a very effective proxy war against the US and should be kept from interfering in Iraq. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gather international support for partitioning • Encourage NATO to supply approximately 60,000 troops 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Form a new framework of international support under UNSC authority • Give central role to Iraq's neighbors • Use most military from Arab-speaking countries (around 60,000 troops) • All states participating agree to forgo unilateral security efforts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make significant efforts to engage allies and countries in the region • Discourage Iranian and Syrian involvement by establishing clear repercussions for crossing "red lines" 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Direct talks with all nations in the region, plus Iran and Syria



	Iraq Study Group Withdrawal	White House Surge	O'Hanlon/Joseph Soft Partition	Conetta Multilateralism	Byman Containment	Edwards Withdrawal
Dealing With A Divided State	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Iraqi leaders should bridge sectarian divide and marginalize militias 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Federalism is the only solution, but the US should not get involved in the creation of ethnically homogenous areas as it would be too problematic and politically explosive 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Soft partition through ordered population relocation (2-5 million people) • Job creation and housing programs, land swaps, etc. • Split up oil revenues (25% population, 35% states, 20% government, 20% variable) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integrate Sunni community into political process (amnesty for non-al Qaeda, no de-Baathification, expedient withdrawal) • Gain acceptance of Shia factions through regional actors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Avoid external attempts at partitioning: these would probably escalate the civil war (Yugoslavia was different) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National peace conference involving all neighbors
Aftermath	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some troops (embedded in Iraqi units) remain indefinitely for training, counter-terrorism and advisory and support roles 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are no details yet on the White House plan to deal with aftermath from the surge. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 300,000 troops will police and secure Iraq's internal borders (50,000 US, 150,000 NATO and Iraqi) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • US troops to be replaced by international force • Maintain external deterrent force of 15,000 deployable to Iraq • Focus on training and hand-over to international mission until withdrawal is complete 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 20,000 regional special forces remain for counter-terrorism, training/assistance to Iraq government and containing civil war • Significant financial and technical assistance to Jordan, Saudi Arabia, Lebanon, Kuwait and Bahrain to prevent refugee-based destabilization • No backing for individual factions in Iraq 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All permanent bases removed from Iraq • Sufficient troops remain in the region to prevent spill-over and genocide, and hunt terrorists